

MARK S. POSARD (SBN: 208790)
JENNIFER M. HOLLY (SBN 263705)
PATRICK C. CROWL (SBN: 313735)
GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI, LLP
3 Parkcenter Drive, Suite 200
Sacramento, CA 95825
Telephone: (916) 565-2900
Facsimile: (916) 920-4402
mposard@grsm.com
jholly@grsm.com
pcrowl@grsm.com

Attorneys for Defendant
LIT K. FUNG, M.D.

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA - SACRAMENTO DIVISION

STEPHEN NOBLE, M.D.,

Plaintiff,

vs.

THE GOULD MEDICAL GROUP, INC.,
SUTTER GOULD MEDICAL FOUNDATION,
SUTTER VALLEY MEDICAL
FOUNDATION, INC., SUTTER HEALTH,
SUTTER MEMORIAL MEDICAL CENTER,
LIT K. FUNG, M.D., AND DOES 1-100

Defendants

Case No.: **2:21-CV-01433-MCE-CKD**

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

**JURY TRIAL DEMANDED
(RULE 201 - FED. R. CIV. P. 38)**

1 **IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED** by and between Plaintiff, STEPHEN NOBLE, by and
2 through his attorneys, and Defendants THE GOULD MEDICAL GROUP, INC., SUTTER
3 VALLEY MEDICAL FOUNDATION (erroneously sued as “Sutter Gould Medical Foundation”
4 and “Sutter Valley Medical Foundation, Inc.”), SUTTER HEALTH, SUTTER VALLEY
5 HOSPITALS (erroneously sued as “Sutter Memorial Medical Center”), LIT K. FUNG, M.D by
6 and through their attorneys, that in order to facilitate the exchange of information and documents which
7 may be subject to confidentiality limitations on disclosure due to federal laws, state laws, and privacy
8 rights stipulate as follows:

9 1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

10 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential,
11 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for
12 any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby
13 stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties
14 acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
15 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited
16 information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The
17 parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does
18 not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 141.1 sets forth the
19 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission
20 from the court to file material under seal.

21 2. DEFINITIONS

22 2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or
23 items under this Order.

24 2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated,
25 stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure
26 26(c).

27 2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
28 their support staff).

2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action.

2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, insurers, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this action.

2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

///

1 3. SCOPE

2 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as
 3 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies,
 4 excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
 5 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. However, the protections
 6 conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following information: (a) any information that is
 7 in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain
 8 after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order,
 9 including becoming part of the public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to
 10 the Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a
 11 source who obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating
 12 Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

13 4. DURATION

14 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order
 15 shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise
 16 directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this
 17 action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all
 18 appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, including the time limits for filing any
 19 motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

20 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

21 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or Non-
 22 Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such
 23 designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must
 24 designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications
 25 that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which
 26 protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

27 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be
 28 clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber or

1 retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties)
2 expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

3 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for
4 protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that
5 it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

6 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g.,
7 second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery
8 Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is
9 disclosed or produced.

10 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

11 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but
12 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix
13 the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions
14 of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the
15 protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

16 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not
17 designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would like
18 copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available
19 for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the
20 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or
21 portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents,
22 the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL" legend to each page that contains Protected
23 Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
24 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
25 margins).

26 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the
27 Designating Party identify within 20 days after receipt of the transcript, all protected testimony.

28 / / /

(c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely

1 manner.

2 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court intervention,
 3 the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality (in compliance with Civil
 4 Local Rule 141.1, if applicable) within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the
 5 parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each
 6 such motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied
 7 with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating
 8 Party to make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable)
 9 shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each challenged designation. In addition, the
 10 Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if there is good
 11 cause for doing so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions
 12 thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be accompanied by a competent declaration
 13 affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed by the preceding
 14 paragraph.

15 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party.
 16 Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary
 17 expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the
 18 Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion to retain
 19 confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of
 20 protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the court rules on the
 21 challenge.

22 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

23 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or
 24 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting, defending,
 25 or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of
 26 persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a
 27 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

28 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a

secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

(a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

(b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

(c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

(d) the court and its personnel;

(e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

(f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels

1 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

2 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a
3 copy of the subpoena or court order;

4 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in
5 the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this
6 Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

7 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the
8 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

9 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or
10 court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a
11 determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the
12 Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
13 protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as
14 authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another
15 court.

16 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS
17 LITIGATION

18 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in
19 this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in
20 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.
21 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional
22 protections.

23 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a
24 Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the
25 Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

26 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that
27 some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

28 / / /

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

(c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated

1 protective order submitted to the court.

2 12. MISCELLANEOUS

3 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its
4 modification by the court in the future.

5 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no
6 Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or
7 item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right
8 to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

9 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or a
10 court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public
11 record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material
12 must comply with Civil Local Rule 141.1. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a
13 court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule
14 141.1, a sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is
15 privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving
16 Party's request to file Protected Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 141.1 is denied by the
17 court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record pursuant to Civil Local Rule
18 141.1 unless otherwise instructed by the court.

19 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

20 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each Receiving
21 Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this
22 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other
23 format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned
24 or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the
25 same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category,
26 where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the
27 Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format
28 reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are

entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

Approved Date:

Date: 5/12/22

/s/ Daniel Kitzes (as authorized on 5/12/2022)

FOX ROTHSCHILD LLP

By: Alex Hernaez

Attorneys for Defendants SUTTER

HEALTH; SUTTER VALLEY MEDICAL

FOUNDATION; and SUTTER VALLEY HOSPITALS

Date: 5/12/22

/s/ Patrick C. Cowl

GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI

By: Patrick C. Cowl

Attorneys for Defendant LIT K. FUNG, M.D.

1 Dated: 5/13/22

2 /s/ Carla Hartley (as authorized on 5/13/2022)

3 DILLINGHAM & MURPHY LLP

4 By: Carla Hartley

5 Attorneys for Defendant THE GOULD MEDICAL
6 GROUP, INC.

7 Dated: 5/13/22

8 /s/ Ryan L. Hicks (as authorized on 5/13/2022)

9 HOYER & HICKS

10 By: Ryan L. Hicks

11 Attorney for Stephen Noble, M.D.

12 **ORDER**

13 GOOD CAUSE APPEARING, the Court hereby approves this Stipulation and Protective Order.

14 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

15 Dated: May 17, 2022

16 

17 CAROLYN K. DELANEY

18 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

19 8.Noble21cv1433